

The following chart represents the data collected on two separate assessment workshops following Ms. Jill Ferguson's presentations on the Lumina DQP. An anonymized paper was handed out to the faculty, who were asked to evaluate it per the descriptors in the rubric.

The scores are divided into morning, afternoon, and cumulative tallies (x/y/z). It is worth noting that both sessions were in high agreement with each other despite lack of calibration/norming.

This exercise points out that while there is a high level of agreement among faculty, the presence of outliers signifies that there is still some lingering incongruity about what constitutes levels of proficiency—this can potentially emerge as “mixed” signals given to students about their work and performance, thus rendering the institution as a haphazard (as opposed to a concerted) learning environment.

What was also pointed out is the information not assessed by the rubric, but which is equally important in evaluating overall student success. The fact that (1) the paper comes from an upper division course, (2) was written by a non-major from a science background, and (3) the assignment asked the student to undertake a synthesis of advanced literary theory to which the student had little previous exposure are all important factors in understanding the problems in this particular course—English 469: Disney and the Representation of Difference. Such classes attract many non-majors due to the content; however, this leaves teachers facing bifurcated populations of students—in this instance, some who are very familiar with MLA conventions and literary theory, and some who have very little exposure to such training. This kind of additional “data” is also crucial for Programs and Departments to consider as they undertake assessment.

Rubric for Information Literacy

Results of February 27 Workshops

Seri Luangphinit, Chair of the Assessment
Support Committee

Rubric for Information Literacy

	Documentation Conventions	Appropriateness of Sources	Evaluating Sources	Integrating Sources
4 (Advanced)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No errors with regard to citation format (in-text and bibliography) Properly documents citations and sources <p style="text-align: center;">1/0 (1)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All sources are relevant and appropriate to the assignment and course Utilizes a variety of appropriate sources, including peer-reviewed material <p style="text-align: center;">1/0 (1)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Student demonstrates in-depth examination of information and/or material which coincide with specific needs and goals in the paper Examination of information shows a clear understanding of the material's criteria for inclusion (i.e. authority, credibility, relevance, timeliness, and accuracy) <p style="text-align: center;">0/0 (0)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Student synthesizes information with a clear sense of direction/purpose in the assignment Student draws exceptional conclusions or insights based on the information cited Use of information leads to highly developed arguments, follow-ups, ideas, appeals, proposals, etc. <p style="text-align: center;">0/0 (0)</p>
3 (Competent)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In-text citations match bibliography and vice versa. Minor errors with citation format. <p style="text-align: center;">5/5 (10)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Most sources are relevant and appropriate to the assignment and course A majority of the sources are relevant but may not show variety or breadth <p style="text-align: center;">10/5 (15)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Student demonstrates adequate examination of the material There may be minor problems with the articulation of appropriateness of material to the assignment <p style="text-align: center;">5/1 (6)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Student adequately synthesizes information Student demonstrates some insight but conclusions or interpretations may seem obvious <p style="text-align: center;">2/0 (2)</p>
2 (Emerging)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Incorrect use of required citation format May include a bibliography but entries may not correlate to sources used in the paper <p style="text-align: center;">13/5 (18)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Uses mostly online (non-scholarly) sites Sources do not appear to be peer-reviewed or from reputable (government or professional organizations) sites <p style="text-align: center;">6/5 (11)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Student may exhibit some attempt to examine the information using academic criteria Information and/or sources are questionable <p style="text-align: center;">9/7 (16)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Student includes information but exhibits problems in synthesizing it into the assignment Follow-up discussion of material may be minimal, unsubstantiated, and/or unoriginal <p style="text-align: center;">15/10 (25)</p>
1 (Beginning)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No citations and/or bibliography Copies or paraphrases without documentation <p style="text-align: center;">0/0 (0)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No relevant sources Paper is mainly speculative on the part of the writer <p style="text-align: center;">0/1 (1)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No effort to examine the information Little awareness of the quality of the information <p style="text-align: center;">2/3 (5)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No synthesis of material into the assignment Student may plagiarize or paraphrase information without citing sources <p style="text-align: center;">3/0 (3)</p>

Anonymous

Professor XXX

Course YYY

15 Feb 2012

Paper #1

The Authentic Fantasy of Disney

Walt Disney's Enchanted Tiki Room is the first ever audio-animatronic attraction and has locations at both Disneyland and Disneyworld. This attraction features a "Hawaiian" theme; according to the Walt Disney World Resort website's "Fun Facts": "The Tiki gods that can be seen in and around the showroom are fashioned after the mythological Tiki gods of Polynesian Islands—particularly Hawai'i, Fiji, Tonga, and the Cook Islands" ("Walt Disney World"). These Tiki gods actually speak and give brief histories of their origins and stories. They even speak in Hawaiian and Pidgin, giving them a truly "authentic" quality.

Disney's representation of the Polynesian Islands through these Tiki gods, gives the audience a distorted impression that all the islands are similar, yielding uniform cultures. In fact, this is not the case. Those who have not, first hand, experienced another culture have nothing to relate it to other than what they



Figure 1. The tiki god Maui at Disneyland's "The Enchanted Tiki Room" (DeCaro)

see from the perspectives of others, in this case Disney. This gives those who have had such experiences the authority to impose their personal opinions and observations upon ignorant spectators. The Enchanted Tiki Room heavily relies on Hawaiian culture for its offer of entertainment, courtesy of none other than Hawai'i's own Dole Food Company.

When Hawai'i was discovered, Americans found an opportunity to showcase "otherness" and exploit it as fantasy. While preserving the uniqueness of Hawai'i to promote tourism, America also colonialized it in order to make it more "American-friendly." Tourism promotes Hawai'i through its portrayal by Americans, not the Native Hawaiians. Thus, Hawai'i's perception by spectators is not authentic. According to Haunani-Kay Trask, a Native Hawaiian activist, Hawai'i is "Mostly a state of mind, Hawai'i is the image of escape from the rawness and violence of daily American life." Disney has amplified this in its portrayal of Hawai'i in the Tiki Room as well as the film *Lilo and Stitch*.

Disney utilizes this "otherness" to captivate audiences, for the promise of adventure in previously unknown territory. On the topic of "otherness," Homi K. Bhabha says:

... that 'otherness' which is at once an object of desire and derision, an articulation of difference contained within the fantasy of origin and identity. (63)

While it has already been addressed that fantasy provokes obsession with "otherness," before we can analyze "otherness," we must first understand the creation of difference.

Many times, we define the "other" by what we are not. According to Edward Said:

[the] binomial opposition of ‘ours’ and ‘theirs,’ with the former always encroaching upon the latter (even to the point of making ‘theirs’ exclusively a function of ‘ours’). (58)

“Otherness” also indicates an imbalance of equality. While the battle between “ours” vs. “theirs,” “they” must always exist in order for “us” to compare. Because the intrigue of “the other” is so strong, Disney is able to exploit this fascination with “other” cultures and turn it into entertainment.

Disney observes the differences between “us” and “them” and amplifies them through animation and humor. However unrealistic, it cannot be ignored that Americans who watch Disney animations tend to absorb what they see on film and assume it to be true; the first impression often makes the most impact. First impressions include skin color and race; the acknowledgement of race is instinctual, as is the discrimination against that race. According to Bhabha,

This is precisely the kind of recognition, as spontaneous and visible, that is attributed to the stereotype. The difference of the object of discrimination is at once visible and natural – colour as the cultural/political *sign* of inferiority or degeneracy, skin as its natural *‘identity’*. (67)

All the stereotypes associated with that race are assumed and the individual is treated respectively.

For those who have not, first hand, experienced another culture have nothing to relate it to other than what they see from the perspectives of others. This gives those who have had such experiences and resources the authority to impose their personal opinions and observations upon ignorant spectators. The problem with this is that, once again, true

authenticity becomes obsolete. For example with the film *Lilo & Stitch*, there are many inconsistencies that make authenticity questionable.



Figure 2. *Lilo and her halau at hula practice (Movie lilo and stitch hula)*

Lilo & Stitch begins with Lilo being late to hula practice after a trip to the beach. As Lilo hurries to the halau, she puts on her grass skirt, bracelets and anklets. When Lilo finally arrives, the rest of the halau is adorned in this attire as well (Figure 2). It is later discovered that the halau is merely practicing that

the inconsistencies in modern hula practices unfolds. It is unrealistic to be practicing with these because it takes a long time to make “authentic” ti leaf skirts, and other accessories, and they only last for a few days. These accessories are created and worn only at special occasions or performances.

Disney also incorporated Elvis into the movie as Lilo’s idol. This was probably to make the connection between Elvis and the movie he filmed in Hawai‘i, “Blue Hawai‘i.” The portrayal of Hawai‘i in Elvis’ movie, prior to *Lilo and Stitch*, provided the schema for all



Figure 3. *Lilo and her idol, Elvis (You Came Back)*

those who have never been to Hawai'i. This is to unify the previous ideas and stereotypes of Hawai'i to those presented in *Lilo and Stitch*.

Another indication of inauthenticity is the lack of "Americanized" locations in Hawai'i. When Nani loses her job at the "fakey luau," she goes around town looking for a new one. In her desperation to keep Lilo, she goes around town to the local stores looking for a job. However, if she was so desperate, why didn't she go to McDonald's or other mainstream franchises and American icons that have been in Hawai'i for decades? The film depicts Kaua'i as a more degenerate location. The only mainstream place Nani looks for a job is at a local hotel. This goes to show Disney's loyalty to the promotion of tourism in Hawai'i.

Tourism is Hawai'i's main source of economic income. For the people that live in Hawai'i it is a known fact that the economic status of the state is dependent on tourism. Haunani-Kay Trask argues:

Psychologically, our young people have begun to think of tourism as the only employment opportunity, trapped as they are by the lack of alternatives...Of course, many Hawaiians do not see tourism as part of their colonization. Thus tourism is viewed as providing jobs, not as a form of cultural prostitution... To me, this is a measure of the depth of our mental oppression we can't understand our own cultural degradation because we are living it. As colonized people, we are colonized to the extent that we are unaware of our oppression. When awareness begins, then so too does de-colonization. (194-95)

Many of the Native Hawaiians believe the current state of the islands to be “normal” as they have, over many years, been trained to believe this to be true. So while America fantasizes Hawaiian living because it is different, America is also trying to force Hawai‘i to integrate into a “normalized” lifestyle.

Bhabha provides the argument, “The objective of colonial discourse is to construe the colonized as a population of degenerate types on the basis of racial origin, in order to justify conquest and to establish systems of administration and instruction” (65). One could say that Disney is exploiting Hawai‘i as a degenerate culture in order to prove America’s superiority.

This brings to light the repercussions of “studying” a culture. First, we must ask, who is doing the studying? If the answer is a non-native visitor, then the resulting data collected cannot truly be considered authentic. For Disney, Americans have provided the bulk of the “studying,” and thus, stereotypes are created through American eyes.



Figure 4. Stitch-Aloha from Hawaii

This disconnect between those “studying” and those being “studied” proves to have negative ramifications. In response to the overuse of the Hawaiian word “aloha,” Trask states: “The use of [Aloha] in a capitalist context is so far removed from any Hawaiian cultural sense that it is, literally, meaningless” (194).

To the Hawaiian people, “aloha” means so much more than its colloquial translation of “hello,” “goodbye,” and “I love you.” According to Trask, “... aloha is freely given and freely returned, it is not and cannot be demanded, or commanded. Above all, aloha is a cultural feeling and practice that works among the people and between the people and their land” (187). Aloha has a much deeper, indefinable meaning that cannot be merely spoken, but must be experienced.

As Disney appeals to children, Americans grow up from children to adults with misconceptions of “other” cultures. Like the empty promise of “happily ever after,” Disney offers its interpretation of “other” cultures and their “authenticity.” The exploitation of fantasy as authentic delves the desire for fantasy to become reality. Perhaps Disney is merely providing an outlet for those desperate to live vicariously through its illusory philosophies. Regardless, a warning to those who do watch Disney to “study” other cultures, you should probably find a new resource. Or maybe invest in a vacation and experience the “fantasy” for yourself.

Works Cited

- Bhabha, Homi K. “From ‘The “Other” Question’ (1983).” *A Critical and Cultural Theory Reader*. Ed. Anthony Easthope and Kate McGowan. 2nd ed. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2004. 62-69.
- DeCaro, Dave. *Maui June 2008*. 2008. Photograph. Daveland. Web. 10 Feb 2012. <http://davelandweb.com/tikiroom/images/2000/exterior/DSC_5235.jpg>.
- “Disneyland Enchanted Tiki Room - Original Show.” *Online Posting*. YouTube, 27 July 2006. Web. 8 Feb 2012. <<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fhApjPASb64>>.

Movie lilo and stitch hula. 2009. Graphic. E Maua Ola i Moku o Keawe. Web. 12 Feb 2012. <http://kinialohaguy.files.wordpress.com/2009/03/movie_lilo_and_stitch_hula.jpg?w=780>

Said, Edward. "From 'From *Orientalism*' (1978)." *A Critical and Cultural Theory Reader*. Ed. Anthony Easthope and Kate McGowan. 2nd ed. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2004. 55-61.

Stitch-Aloha from Hawaii. N.d. Graphic. myfreewallpapers.com Web. 13 Feb 2012. <<http://www.myfreewallpapers.net/cartoons/wallpapers/stitch-aloha-from-hawaii.jpg>>

Trask, Haunani-Kay. "Lovely Hula Hands, Corporate Tourism and the Prostitution of Hawaiian Culture." *From a Native Daughter: Colonialism & Sovereignty in Hawai'i*. Common Courage: Monroe, 1993. 179-97. Print.

"Walt Disney's Enchanted Tiki Room." *Walt Disney World*. N.p., n.d. Web. 8 Feb 2012. <<http://disneyworld.disney.go.com/parks/magic-kingdom/attractions/enchanted-tiki-room/>>.

You Came Back. 2011. Graphic. tumblr Web. 13 Feb 2012. <http://25.media.tumblr.com/tumblr_lj9asrxuPp1qidlr1o1_500.jpg>.